

**MINUTES**  
**Student Activity Fee Board Meeting**  
**Friday, December 5<sup>th</sup>, 2008**  
**404 Old Main**

**Attendance:**

**Board Members:**

Jack Rayman, Senior Director, Career Services; Chair, Student Activity Fee Board  
Kendra Carr, UPAC Chair  
Christopher Cycak, CCSG Representative, SGA President (Altoona)  
Mary Edgington, Senior Director, Union & Student Activities  
Roger Egolf, Faculty Senate Committee on Student Life, Penn State Lehigh Valley  
Kathie Flanagan-Herstek, Director of Student & Enrollment, Penn State Wilkes-Barre  
Ben Gilson, CCSG Representative, Penn State Erie (Behrend)  
Gavin Keirans, UPUA President  
Erin Kennedy, CCSG Representative, Penn State Erie (Behrend)  
George Khoury, CCSG President  
Alfonso Mendoza, GSA President  
Ralph Crivello, UPUA Representative

**Substitutes:**

Dwayne Hilton for Chris Rizzo

**Staff:**

Jay Arcuri, Assistant Director, Central Office for Commonwealth Student Activities  
Heide Port, Administrative Support Assistant, Union & Student Activities

**Absent**

Chris Rizzo, Director of Student Affairs, Penn State Beaver Representative

**Introductions**

Roll call taken.

**Announcements**

Jack Rayman handed out a blue sheet (attachment 1) to all members of the Board. Jack explained in further detail and emphasized # 6, 7 and 8 on this list.

#6 – The subsequent meetings for December have been cancelled but will reconvene in January. When they reconvene, there will be a specified chair and recorder for each meeting. It is important that there be involvement from all board members at these

meetings. They have been poorly attended and these meetings are being held at your request so please be in attendance.

#7 – Substitutes will not be added to the email list for the Board. It is the member's responsibility to share the information with their substitute. The approved information is posted on the web under the SAF Board website.

<http://www.sa.psu.edu/usa/studentactivities/fee.shtml>

#8 – Please let Heide know if you will be joining the phone conferences for the subcommittee meetings. It is important for us to know who will be joining the meetings.

The attachment is attached in Appendix 1.

### **Adoption of the Minutes**

A motion was made by Mary Edgington to accept the minutes and seconded by Alfonso Mendoza. All were in favor.

### **Adoption of the Agenda**

Kendra Carr asked that item 1 on the agenda be moved to another section on the agenda.

A motion was made by George Khoury to accept the agenda and seconded by Kendra Carr. All were in favor.

### **Public Comments**

There were no comments from the gallery.

### **Discussion Items**

First item on the agenda was "Policy and Procedure Proposed Changes". Item #1, Christopher Cycak asked if the reference to "Full Student Activities Fee Board" meant that everyone must be present for a vote or if it was going to be a quorum as discussed before. It was agreed that it would be a quorum of those in attendance. This statement will be changed to "a vote of the Student Activities Fee Board".

Kendra Car would like to change the word in this section from determined to defined.

Ben Gilson asked if this would mean that the fee would automatically be changed.

Jack Rayman stated that this is not clear with this statement.

Ralph Crivello stated that how he reads this statement is that if the fee goes above the CPI (Consumer Price Index), it would then need to be voted on.

Dwayne Hilton reminded the Board that this Board does not set the fee but that the Board of Trustees set it.

It was decided that any recommended change will occur only by a vote from the SAFB Board. The rate of inflation will be determined by the CPI (Consumer Price Index). Ralph Crivello stated that this is the lowest index available for use.

There was a motion by George Khoury to accept these changes and a 2<sup>nd</sup> from Christopher Cycak. All in favor.

Item #2 – The hiring of legal services.

George Khoury does not support this change. Ben Gilson stated that this could become an expensive change.

Jack Rayman stated that the original intent was to prevent student activity fees from being used to pay student legal fees but was not intended to prevent student activity fees from supporting legal services for students.

Kendra Carr voiced her concerns that this is too vague.

Ralph Crivello stated that this is in reference to the UPUA proposed legislation and that he did not have a copy with him.

Dwayne Hilton stated that the term “legal services” covers a lot of territory.

Ben Gilson stated that we don’t want this to fund any DUI or criminal charges. This needs to be clarified as to what it allows.

George Khoury stated that legal services are very important and there are things that need to be funded but he doesn’t feel that the student activity fee should be covering these fees. The student activity fee is to benefit ALL students not just the people who have done something wrong.

Ben Gilson referenced a rape case and that doesn’t send the right precedent. Student activity fees are to be used for a concert or something all students can engage in.

Kendra Carr suggested that it needs to be clarified that these legal fees are to be specified for wills, job type items but not for DUI or criminal charges.

Kathy Flanagan-Herstek stated that the Commonwealth Campuses have had great angst with the use of student activity fees for legal services.

Ralph Crivello defended this change as a guideline of general principles.

George Khoury stated that these are philosophical services and that there needs to be funding for them but not from the student activities fees but mostly likely from the Student Affairs budget. He will vote no on this proposal.

Ralph Crivello stated that the student activity fee is to promote out of classroom activities but that they don't cover the liabilities and that the legal services are necessary.

Kendra Carr stated that these activities are covered under the liability insurance of the University.

Jack Rayman pointed out that using student activity fee resources in support of student legal services is analogous to the current practice of using student activity fees in support of student health services.

George Khoury stated that he felt the Health Center benefits all students and that it promotes the well being of all students.

Jack Rayman stated that not all students use the student health service just as not all students would use student legal services.

Ralph Crivello stated that he does not use these services.

Kendra Carr suggested changing this proposal to state that the legal services do not include legal defense services.

Roger Egolf suggested changing the wording to say for legal council and not for legal representation.

Kendra Carr moved to table items 2 and 3 and Mary Edgington seconded the motion.

A vote was taken.

<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Jack Rayman	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Kendra Carr	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Christopher Cycak	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Mary Edgington
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Roger Egolf	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Kathie Flanagan-Herstek	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Ben Gilson	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Gavin Keirans
<input type="checkbox"/> N	Erin Kennedy	<input type="checkbox"/> AB	George Khoury	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Alfonso Mendoza	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Dwayne Hilton
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Ralph Crivello						

7 yes to table

5 no to table

1 abstention

This proposal will be discussed and further refined in subcommittee in January.

#4 – Money for wages

Kathie Flanagan-Hersek brought this topic up because her colleagues have concerns that during difficult times, the SAF Board will be railroaded into using these funds to fund salaries.

Gavin Keirins wanted to know who would determine the limited cases as stated in this definition.

Jack Rayman stated that the “limited need” and “student need” need to be clarified.

Mary Edgington asked for some history on why this is being added.

Kathie Flanagan-Hertsek stated that her campus, Wilkes Barre, lives on a very tight budget. There is a fear that it would be too easy to use the SA funds for student help.

Dwayne Hilton added that this would open the door up to salaries and that could deplete the student activity fees at the campus locations.

Roger Egolf stated that this is very restricting in the current form of the policy.

Andrew was given the floor and stated that this proposed change was due to the policy adding legal services.

Dwayne Hilton stated that this could have broader implications.

George Khoury felt that his problem with this was the word “salaries”.

Ben Gilson stated that this would prevent a situation where a strong DSA would want to have more staff and would try to push this against a weaker group and possibly deplete the funds.

Ralph Crivello stated that a solution to this would be for the Board to authorize who would be the authorizing body on these special cases.

George Khoury stated that in that case a DSA would have to make a proposal to the Board for approval.

Kendra Carr stated that this was not so much for the students but for the staff.

Jack Rayman stated that we need to develop the right language for this.

A motion to table this proposed change was made by Gavin Keirins and a 2<sup>nd</sup> from Alfonso Mendoza. All were in favor.

This proposal will be discussed and refined in subcommittee in January.

#6 – Student Activities – Commonwealth Campuses.

Motion by George Khoury to table this item and a 2<sup>nd</sup> by Gavin Keirins. All in favor.

This proposal will be discussed and refined in subcommittee in January.

UPUA/GSA Funding Proposal (See attached proposal attachment 2)

Discussion ensued.

George Khoury stated that he was in favor of this proposal but what does this mean if we vote on this. Does it mean we are held to these guidelines? What does it mean?

Andrew Karasik stated that he and Alfonso Mendoza wrote this proposal. This proposal is an authorization that they will receive a percentage of funding. It means that in January these groups will come back to the Board with a budget proposal and at that time a percentage will be decided upon.

Kendra Carr asked if this meant the Board would be voting on the whole thing right now.

George Khoury stated that he was confused because Alfonso Mendoza is calling this a proposal and Andrew Karasik is calling this an authorization. Is this a proposal to tell us about this or is this a policy?

Ralph Crivello stated that this is a proposal to create policy. The vote today would accept the proposal to start to create a policy.

Kathie Flanagan-Hertsek is uncomfortable with the wording by only looking out 1 year ahead.

George Khoury is uncomfortable with us voting on this without any background information. There is not a projected budget attached giving justification of this request. This would be a binding agreement but there is not justification. The collegian article showed justification that you (UPUA) gave them but you didn't share it with this Board. George is not comfortable with being mandated to follow this without having an idea of what you are going to spend all this money on.

Much discussion ensued.

Jay Arcuri stated that at the subcommittee meetings that it was discussed that this proposal would be reviewed again in 3 years.

Kendra Carr believes that the language needs to be changed to make that clear.

Gavin Keirins stated that this could happen.

Jack Rayman stated that this discussion is the sort that could have happened at the subcommittee meetings and that the attendance of those meetings is crucial.

Kendra Carr stated that this is still a working document and that some language needs some clarification.

More discussion.

Roger Egolf recommended making a change to the wording in point 1 that would state that both governments MAY receive funding and not WILL.

Kendra Carr stated that the only thing this Board is looking at right now is that they can come to the Board and ask for money.

Ralph Crivello stated that the governments will not be an allocating Board.

Dwayne Hilton stated that Kendra brings up a good point. Will this proposal cause other groups to come to this Board to ask for money as well?

Gavin Keirins stated that these three organizations are the only ones that are “defined” by the Board of Trustees.

George Khoury reminded them that the Board of Trustees can change these groups at any time. He also stated that the timeline that is provided is good but he wants justification before a vote can be taken.

Roger Egolf asked if this could be separated out and just pieces of the proposal be voted on.

Discussion ensued.

Ben Gilson stated that we are all in agreement that these organizations should get money.

George Khoury stated that there are two separate issues here: 1. yes to receive money and 2. How much.

More discussion ensued.

Kendra Carr stated that she felt it would be irresponsible to put both pieces up for a vote at this time because there is definitely more work to be done.

Mary Edgington made a statement to change the verbiage to: “Both governments will receive funding based on a percentage of the student activity fee each year”.

Ben Gilson made a motion to accept this for item #1 and a 2<sup>nd</sup> by Gavin Keirins was recorded.

Vote taken.

<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Jack Rayman	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Kendra Carr	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Christopher Cycak	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Mary Edgington
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Roger Egolf	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Kathie Flanagan-Herstek	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Ben Gilson	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Gavin Keirans
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Erin Kennedy	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	George Khoury	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Alfonso Mendoza	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Dwayne Hilton
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Ralph Crivello						

11 votes YES and 1 vote NO.

Ralph Crivello made a motion to go point by point and Mary Edgington seconded that motion.

The vote is YES to adopt the item and NO to table the item.

#2

<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Jack Rayman	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Kendra Carr	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Christopher Cycak	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Mary Edgington
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Roger Egolf	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Kathie Flanagan-Herstek	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Ben Gilson	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Gavin Keirans
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Erin Kennedy	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	George Khoury	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Alfonso Mendoza	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Dwayne Hilton
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Ralph Crivello						

12 votes YES and 1 vote NO.

#3

<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Jack Rayman	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Kendra Carr	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Christopher Cycak	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Mary Edgington
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Roger Egolf	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Kathie Flanagan-Herstek	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Ben Gilson	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Gavin Keirans
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Erin Kennedy	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	George Khoury	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Alfonso Mendoza	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Dwayne Hilton
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Ralph Crivello						

11 votes YES and 2 votes NO

#4

<input type="checkbox"/> N	Jack Rayman	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Kendra Carr	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Christopher Cycak	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Mary Edgington
<input type="checkbox"/> N	Roger Egolf	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Kathie Flanagan-Herstek	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Ben Gilson	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Gavin Keirans
<input type="checkbox"/> N	Erin Kennedy	<input type="checkbox"/> N	George Khoury	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Alfonso Mendoza	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Dwayne Hilton
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Ralph Crivello						

12 votes NO and 1 vote YES.

#5

<input type="checkbox"/> N	Jack Rayman	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Kendra Carr	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Christopher Cycak	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Mary Edgington
<input type="checkbox"/> N	Roger Egolf	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Kathie Flanagan-Herstek	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Ben Gilson	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Gavin Keirans
<input type="checkbox"/> N	Erin Kennedy	<input type="checkbox"/> N	George Khoury	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Alfonso Mendoza	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Dwayne Hilton
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Ralph Crivello						

9 votes NO and 3 votes YES

#6

<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Jack Rayman	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Kendra Carr	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Christopher Cycak	<input type="checkbox"/> N	Mary Edgington
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Roger Egolf	<input type="checkbox"/> AB	Kathie Flanagan-Herstek	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Ben Gilson	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Gavin Keirans
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Erin Kennedy	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	George Khoury	<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Alfonso Mendoza	<input type="checkbox"/> AB	Dwayne Hilton
<input type="checkbox"/> Y	Ralph Crivello						

Mary Edgington did not receive a definition of co sponsorship. This will need to be provided by Ralph Crivello. A vote was taken but no satisfactory definition was ever received. Thus, this item will have to be revisited and voted on at a subsequent meeting.

8 votes YES, 2 votes NO and 2 abstained from voting.

#7

Y  Jack Rayman     Y  Kendra Carr     N  Christopher Cycak     Y  Mary Edgington  
 Y  Roger Egolf     Y  Kathie Flanagan-Herstek     Y  Ben Gilson     Y  Gavin Keirans  
 Y  Erin Kennedy     Y  George Khoury     Y  Alfonso Mendoza     Y  Dwayne Hilton  
 Y  Ralph Crivello

Unanimous vote YES.

#8

N  Jack Rayman     N  Kendra Carr     N  Christopher Cycak     N  Mary Edgington  
 N  Roger Egolf     N  Kathie Flanagan-Herstek     N  Ben Gilson     N  Gavin Keirans  
 N  Erin Kennedy     N  George Khoury     N  Alfonso Mendoza     N  Dwayne Hilton  
 Y  Ralph Crivello

11 votes NO and 1 vote YES.

This meeting adjourned at 5:05 p.m. and then reconvened to create an Appeals Committee to review the appeal submitted to the Board. The Appeals Committee will consist of Kathie Flanagan-Hertsek, Ben Gilson and Christopher Cycak.

Meeting then adjourned at 5:15pm.